

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,
Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline 0172-2864100

Email: psic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh.Manjit Singh

S/o Sh. Gurcharan Singh
R/o Village Manemajra,
Tehsil Chamkaur Sahib,
Distt. Ropar
M: 8427498620

...Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer,
O/o MD, Milkfed, PB,
SCO 153-154, Sector- 34A,
Chandigarh

Encl.

First Appellate Authority,

O/o MD, Milkfed, PB,
SCO 153-154, Sector- 34A,
Chandigarh

....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 6716of 2025

Present: Sh. Manjit Singh, the appellant along with Sh. Arun Kumar (7888458554)
Advocate, Sh. AshwaniPrashar (8847235362) through Cisco Webex and Sh. Vikram
Kumar, Senior Assistant (8360785301) at PSIC, on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

The above mentioned case was earlier heard by the Bench of Sh. BhupinderSingh Bath, on 09.07.2026. Thereafter, this case was allocated to the undersigned Bench and this case was fixed for hearing today i.e. 08.10.2026.

2. The respondent filed the written reply on 06.05.2026 and the relevant portion of the same is as follows:

“5. That the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India while deciding **Civil Appeal No. 9017 of 2013-Thalappalam Ser. Coop. Bank Ltd. and others Versus State of Kerala and others** reported as **2013 (4) RCR (Civil) 912** has categorically held that a co-operative society registered under Co-operative Societies Act is not a Public Authority under RTI Act, if the society was not owned, controlled or substantially financed by Government. It has also been held that **"The burden to show that a body is owned, controlled or substantially financed or that a non-government organization is substantially financed directly or indirectly by the funds provided by the appropriate Government is on the applicant who seeks information..."**.”

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,
Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline 0172-2864100

Email: pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: www.infocommpunjab.com



Appeal Case No. 6716of 2025

And also, the respondent relied upon the following judgments:

- S.S. Rana v. Registrar, Co-operative Societies and another, 2006(2) S.C.T. 570: (2006) 11 SCC 634.
- Ajay Hasia v. Khalid MujibSehrawardi (Zoroastrian Coop. Hosuing Society Ltd. V. Distt. Registrar, Coop. Societies (Urban))
- State of West Bengal and another v. NripendraNathBagchi, AIR 1966 SC 447.

3. However, the appellant submitted the counter submissions in this regard, which are taken on record.

4. After perusal of the same, a copy of the same is **being sent** to the respondent with the direction to file the counter submissions, in an annotated form

The respondent PIO is further directed to file an affidavit that the working of the Milkfed is at par with the Housefed and Co-operative Bank. He is further directed to file an affidavit duly sworn, that no State/Centre and/or any loan has been raised wherein the Government has given the guarantee be submitted from the inception of the institution.

5. To come up on **29.10.2026at 11:30 A. M. at Chandigarh.**

Dated: 08.10.2026

**(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner,
Punjab.**

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,
Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline 0172-2864100

Email: pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Gokul Chand Aneja

23 Manor Estate,
Airport Mirankot Road,
Amritsar
M: 8288839707, 9417438707

...Appellant

V/s

Dr. Manjit Singh Rataul
Punjab Information Officer,
O/o Civil Surgeon, Amritsar

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Civil Surgeon, Amritsar

....Respondents

Appeal Case No.7518 of2025
Heard through Cisco Webex

Present: Sh. Gokul Chand Aneja, the appellant Cisco Webex
Sh. Harmeet Singh Oberoi, Advocate (9888889909)
Sh. Arun Kumar, Superintendent PIO Punjab Medical (9463420465) on behalf of
therespondent.

ORDER

This order may be read with reference to the previous order dated 15.09.2026.

2. The response of the respondent is not satisfactory pertaining to the queries raised by the Commission at Point No. 1 to 4 vide order dated 21.05.2026. Regarding query no. 5, the respondent is directed to place on record a copy of the agenda and minutes of general body meeting held on 21.10.2026. Regarding query no. 7, the respondent, Registrar is directed to place on record a copy of the CWP 17463 of 2024 filed by Dr. ParveenDevgan in the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court.

3. In light of the above, the respondent Registrar is directed to file the reply afresh failing which, stringent action will be taken and/or the appropriate recommendation will be sent to the competent authority in accordance with the judgment passed by the Hon'bleMadras High Court W.P.No.17677 of 2010 and M.P.No.1 of 2010 and the relevant portion of the same is reproduced below:

"10. Such Officers must be taught a lesson and in my view, they are unfit to hold the post of Public Information Officer or any other post in connection with the discharge of duties under RTI Act and they should be shown the doors, so that it will be a lesson for other Officers to act in accordance with the terms of the Act, failing which they may also face the similar or more consequences."

4. The Registrar,Medical Council is further directed to submit a copy of the application dated 02.09.2024 submitted by Dr. ParveenDevgan for renewal of his license along with annexures, if any.

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,
Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline 0172-2864100

Email: pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: www.infocommpunjab.com



Appeal Case No.7518 of2025
Heard through Cisco Webex

5. Also, the Registrar, Medical Council, is directed to submit a complete correspondence and noting related to the renewal the license of Dr. Parveen Devgan pertaining to the application 02.09.2024 which was renewed from the back date i.e. 21.06.2024.

6. To come up on **28.10.2026 at 11:30 A. M. at Chandigarh.**

Dated: 08.10.2026

(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner,
Punjab.

CC:

Dr. Rupinder Bakshi
Registrar-Cum-
Public Information Officer,
Punjab Medical Council,
Mohali

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,
Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline 0172-2864100

Email: psic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: www.infocommpunjab.com



Sh. Gurjant Singh

S/o Sh. Bhulada Singh
R/o VPO Chatewala,
Tehsil Talwandi Sabo,
Distt. Bathinda-151302
M: 9517713072, 9855213072

...Appellant

V/s

Public Information Officer,

O/o Director,
Food Civil Supplies &
Consumer Affairs Deptt., PB,
Chandigarh

First Appellate Authority,

O/o Director,
Food Civil Supplies &
Consumer Affairs Deptt., PB,
Chandigarh

....Respondents

Appeal Case No. 15of 2025

Present: Sh. Gurjant Singh, the appellant.
Sh. AnkushGarg (8437701097)
Sh. Dinesh Kumar (9417954461) on behalf of the respondent.

ORDER

The RTI application is dated 06.06.2024 vide which the appellant has sought information as enumerated in his RTI application. First appeal was filed with the First Appellate Authority (hereinafter FAA) on 29.09.2024 and second appeal was filed in the Commission on 19.12.2024 under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005 (hereinafter RTI Act). Notice of hearing was issued to the parties for hearing for today i.e. 08.10.20216

2. The appellant submits that he has filed the complaint against the District Controller Food & Civil Supplies, Bathinda and has sought the information from the Director to whom the complaint was sent.

3. The appellant further submits that the respondent, O/o the Director, Food Civil Supplies & Consumer Affairs Department, Punjab transferred the RTI application to the District Controller, Food & Civil Supplies, Bathinda and he should not be a judge of his own case and the complaint has to be dealt by the Directorate and requested that the PIO, o/o Director, Food Civil Supplies & Consumer Affairs Department, Punjab has not performed his duties enshrined under the RTI Act, 2005, as the complaint of the appellant has been sent to the officer against whom a complaint was filed.

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

Red Cross Building, Near Rose Garden,
Sector 16, Chandigarh.

Ph: 0172-2864101, Helpline 0172-2864100

Email: pcic20@punjabmail.gov.in Visit us: www.infocommpunjab.com



Appeal Case No. 15of 2025

4. In light of the submissions made by the appellant, the PIO, Director, Food Civil Supplies & Consumer Affairs Department, Punjab, Sector 39, Chandigarh, is directed to remain present on the next date of hearing along with the written submissions that why a stringent action may not be taken against him.

5. To come up on **29.10.2026 at 11:30 A. M. at Chandigarh.**

Dated: 08.10.2026

**(Inderpal Singh)
Chief Information Commissioner,
Punjab**

CC:

**Public Information Officer,
O/o Director, Food Civil Supplies &
Consumer Affairs Department, Punjab
Sector-39, Chandigarh**

Encl. RTI application